



ASSESSMENT OF GOOD URBAN GOVERNANCE IN NIGERIA

**AN EXTRACT OF FINDINGS
AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FROM THE
CONSOLIDATED REPORT**

FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF NIGERIA

MAY 2012

UN HABITAT





ASSESSMENT OF GOOD URBAN GOVERNANCE IN NIGERIA

**AN EXTRACT OF FINDINGS
AND RECOMMENDATIONS
FROM THE
CONSOLIDATED REPORT**

FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF NIGERIA

MAY 2012

UN HABITAT



CONTENT PAGE

I. FINDINGS OF THE GOOD URBAN GOVERNANCE STUDY

DESCRIPTIVE INFORMATION

1.1.	Household-level Demographics and Marital Status	5
1.2.	Education	5
1.3.	Religion	5
1.4.	Ownership of Essential Amenities.....	5
1.5.	Awareness about Vision/Mission Statement and Strategic Plan Document	5
1.6.	Use of the Adopted Vision/Mission Statements, LEEDS, Land Use/Structure Plans	5
1.7.	Dissemination of the adopted Vision/Mission Statements.....	6

II. ANALYTICAL INFORMATION

2.1.	SERVICE DELIVERY	7
2.2.	SUBSIDIARITY	8
2.3.	RESOURCE MOBILIZATION	9
2.4.	LOCAL GOVERNMENT CAPACITY	10
2.5.	EQUITY	11
2.6.	PRO-POOR POLICY	11
2.7.	EXISTENCE OF CITIZENS' CHARTER	12
2.8.	PROVISIONS FOR INFORMAL BUSINESS	13
2.9.	GENDER EQUALITY	14
2.10.	ACCESS TO EDUCATION	14

2.11.	RESPECT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RULE OF LAW ...	15
2.12.	PARTICIPATION	15
2.13.	CIVIC ENGAGEMENT/CONSENSUS-BUILDING	16
2.14.	CONDUCT OF REFERENDUM AND METHODS OF CIVIC ENGAGEMENT	16
2.15.	WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN GOVERNANCE	17
2.16.	PARTNERSHIP-BUILDING	17
2.17.	PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING	18
2.18.	SECURITY	18
2.19.	EFFECTIVE POLICING	18
2.20.	ENVIRONMENTAL SECURITY MEASURES	20
2.21.	WASTE MANAGEMENT	21
2.22.	EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS PLAN	21
2.23.	CONFLICT RESOLUTION MEASURES	21
2.24.	TENURE SECURITY	22
2.25.	SOCIAL HOUSING	22
2.26.	ACCOUNTABILITY	22
2.27.	TRANSPARENCY AND FREE FLOW OF INFORMATION	22
2.28.	MECHANISM FOR PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT	23
2.29.	ELIMINATION OF CORRUPTION	23
2.30.	CODE OF CONDUCT	24
2.31.	CITIZENS' DEMAND FOR ACCOUNTABILITY	25
2.32.	EXHIBITED CHALLENGES	26

2.33.	STRUCTURAL/ORGANIZATIONAL PROBLEMS	28
III. CONCLUSIONS ON THE GUG STUDY		
3.0	CONCLUSIONS	32
IV. RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE GUG STUDY		
4.0	RECOMMENDATIONS	36
4.1.	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SHORT-TERM (OR IMMEDIATE) ACTIONS.....	36
4.2	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR MEDIUM-TERM ACTIONS	41
4.3	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LONG-TERM ACTIONS	44
4.4	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FOLLOW-UP STUDIES	46

I. FINDINGS OF THE GOOD URBAN GOVERNANCE STUDY

DESCRIPTIVE INFORMATION

[Some General Characteristics of the Study-Respondents]

1.1. Household-level Demographics and Marital Status:

Out of a total of 2,100 respondents interviewed, 66.7% were heads of households; 18.6%, spouses of household heads; 10.2% were children of household heads; and, the remaining 4.5%, other relations of the household heads. Of this total sample, 62.4% were males; and, the remaining 37.6%, females. The breakdown by marital status showed that 65.6% were married; 23.1% never married; while, 2.6% and 8.5% were divorced, or widowed.

1.2. Education:

Considering that 62.5% of the sampled population possessed senior secondary education and above, it is expected that residents of these LGs should be able to contribute to governance issues through participation.

1.3. Religion:

The distribution of the sample population by religion varies by State.

1.4. Ownership of Essential Amenities:

The sampled population has most of the essentials of living, such as: radio, television, mobile telephones, regenerator, etc. This shows that the people could easily be reached through the mass media, and ICT. The contents of the adopted Vision/Mission statements focused on wide-ranging development issues.

1.5. Awareness about Vision/Mission Statement and Strategic Plan Document:

Over half of the LGs (55.6%) said they adopted participatory approaches to formulation and dissemination of information on strategic visioning of development. However, only a handful of the FGDs conducted confirmed the people's awareness of the existence of Vision/Mission Statements, and Land-Use Plans.

1.6 Use of the Adopted Vision/Mission Statements, LEEDS, Land Use/Structure Plans:

The data collected showed that LGs used the adopted vision/mission/land use/structure plans/LEEDS for different purposes, including political administration, social development, economic development, environmental development, and monitoring and evaluation.

1.7 Dissemination of the adopted Vision/Mission Statements:

The use of the various methods of disseminating information about the visions, mission, land use planning and LEEDs documentation varies with the LGs. The most popular methods used are through the publication of the vision document and their being kept in LGs. Publication of information on-line is not currently used by the LGs - an indication of the low priority accorded the use of information communication technology by LGs.

II. ANALYTICAL INFORMATION

2.1. SERVICE DELIVERY:

2.1.1 Performance of Constitutional Roles

The results of the analysis generally showed that performance of statutory services varies with the LGs, and in accordance with the relationship which exists between the different States and their LGs in granting autonomy. The analysis showed that State Governments and the National Population Commission (NPC) have taken over certain functions that constitutionally belong to the LGs. The Federal Government has taken over registration of birth and death while the States have taken over tenement rating, solid waste management, naming of streets, etc. Some LGs have restrained themselves from performing certain statutory roles, such as the collection of rates on bikes and wheel barrows, e.g. the Ikeja LG; because, the local government is trying to discourage their use in line with the State government's directive.

2.1.2 Perception of the Performance of the Roles of LGs

Many of the States are yet to conduct elections to appoint elected councilors. The Baseline survey also showed that LGs are not adequately addressing issues of the provision of safe drinking water and waste management in their cities. Access to water and sanitation in all the LGs sampled is generally poor. The method of disposal of liquid waste is very poor. On average, those that make use of safe method of disposal of liquid waste, which include flush to sewage, flush to septic tank, use of VIP latrines, on average, amounted to 68.5%. The rest 31.5% uses unsafe methods for disposing liquid waste. Access to potable water in all the urban LGs was generally low.

2.1.3 Local Government Budget for Services and Process for Providing and Assessing Service Delivery

Budgetary allocation for each of the roles performed by LGs was not made available by many of the LGs studied. Ikeja showed a budget that is related

to the services provided for the past three years. A close examination of the total budgets of the LG showed that they hardly prosecute any capital project as only salaries and recurrent expenditures are covered in the budget. While many LGs said they have clear and transparent procedures for accessing their services, there were others which were yet to do so.

2.1.4 Process for Addressing Complaints

Several mechanisms are used by the LGs for redressing grievances, which include both conventional and unconventional methods. LGs cited the use of public opinion survey, town hall meetings, suggestion box and public complaint desk as avenue available for reporting complaints and grievances or to address them. Other mechanisms include: LG's conduct of frequent meetings - which provide opportunities for hearing and dealing with Stakeholders' grievances; the community lodging their complaints through traditional rulers, elected representatives, CBOs, NGOs and FBOs; use of the media; and other methods.

2.2 SUBSIDIARITY:

2.2.1 Autonomy, Interference with LG Roles

All the LGs had responded that they enjoyed no autonomy or, at best, their autonomy was partial and not full. In terms of discharge of constitutional roles as noted for service delivery, both the State and Federal Government have usurped some of the constitutional roles of LGs, especially in the area of registration of births and deaths, tenement rating, physical planning, control of advertisement, etc. All the LGs reported that they experienced undue control over their activities in the areas of budgeting, project implementation, taxation and levies, recruitment of staff and access to loan facilities. The various State Governments, through the Ministries of LG, the Local Government Service Commissions, and States Houses of Assembly exercise control over LGs in these areas.

2.2.2 Decentralization of Functions at the LG Level

Most LGs said they have processes and avenues in place for the citizens to access various services and to lodge complaints through letter writing, suggestion boxes, the elected representatives and various departments.

2.2.3 Areas of decentralization/handled by sub-LG Units

Most LGs have been able to decentralize their roles to lower tiers usually the community development associations. In Lagos State, for example, all the LGs have been subdivided into CDAs and CDCs, with decentralization of power to the latter - which are established by law to function at the community level. In other states, decentralization has been to ward and community levels.

2.3 REVENUE SOURCE MOBILIZATION:

2.3.1 Local Government Income Sources and Predictability

Perhaps, the most common and reliable sources of revenue to LGs are the statutory transfers and internally-generated revenues. However, the LGs need to be urged to make IGR a very sure (or robust) and predictable source of revenue.

2.3.2 Management of Local Government IGR

Statutory transfers and internally generated revenues remained the most reported and relatively dependable sources of revenue to LGs. These are revenues accruing to LGs for performing its constitutional roles, which include:

- (i) Land use charges
- (ii) Parking permit
- (iii) Liquor licenses
- (iv) Eating/Bakery houses licenses;
- (v) Marriage registration fees;
- (vi) Naming street
- (vii) Radio and TV licenses
- (viii) Charges on public toilets

- (ix) Pest control and disinfectants;
- (x) Lock up stores;
- (xi) Burial vault fees;
- (xii) Laboratory test fees
- (xiii) Charges from environmental sanitation services;
- (xiv) Vaccine Yellow Cards/Health Certificate;
- (xv) General contractor registration
- (xvi) Trade licenses fees;

The study has shown that most LGs did experience decreases in actual revenues over the three-year period. The only exceptions were Mainland, Lagos Island, Apapa, Onitsha North and South, and Port-Harcourt. While most LGs have accepted IGR as a dependable source of revenue, they generally lack the required capacity to effectively mobilize and manage the process. Their capacity for resource mobilization, using IGR, is rather low.

2.4 LOCAL GOVERNMENT CAPACITY:

2.4.1 Local Government Staffing and Material Resources

The capacity of LGs to effectively promote good urban governance depends on a number of factors including the staffing resources and the institutional structure among others. The staffing of LGs disaggregated to departments does not show a coherent pattern. Similarly, the organizational structure of LGs does not reflect the roles they were set-up to discharge. Employment is skewed towards administration and less to technical and service oriented departments such as education, health, engineering and planning among others. Although LGs are required to provide parks and gardens, land use planning and many others, they were yet to set-up departments that can provide these services and other neglected services.

2.4.2 Promotion of Staff Development & Capacity-building Needs

Many of the LGs have implemented capacity building training in the past, mostly under donor funded projects implemented by the UNDP, UNICEF

and the World Bank. In most cases, capacity building is usually handled at the State level through the LG Public Service Commission. Some of the LGs came up with a list of areas in which capacity building would be needed, which included:

- Capacity building in information and technology communications, computer appreciation etc
- Modern agricultural techniques
- Management
- Improvement for Secretaries and typists
- Training for effective performance for executives and administration officers
- Special training for health workers.
- Training for political class on leadership.
- Training on accountability
- Training on work ethics (discipline, punctuality etc)
- Training on Retirement Plans
- Training on revenue generation
- Training on Code of Conduct and ethics
- Budget implementation.
- Management skill and;
- Data Management

2.5 EQUITY:

Equity as an element of good governance requires that every citizen in the society should be treated as a stakeholder and not excluded from the mainstream of society.

2.6 PRO-POOR POLICY:

2.6.1 Adoption of Pro-poor Policy

There is no formally-adopted policy on poverty in the country. The LGs which have adopted poverty eradication papers have, by implication, adopted a pro-poor policy of some kind. Regardless of the adoption or non-adoption of pro-poor policy, all LGs - excepting a few - have promoted one

kind of sectoral programme/project, or the other, on poverty eradication in their areas. A critical review of the responses from the various LGs showed that the areas of operation of poverty-eradication projects encompass the provision of services, including health, education, water supply, access to land, access to housing, economic empowerment, street children, child labour, the elderly and physically challenged, the homeless, female-headed households.

2.6.2 Equity in the Distribution of Services

Most LGs had mentioned that there is even distribution of projects across the Wards that constitute their Local Government Area. The data collected from LGs also depicted equitable distribution of education and health facilities among the Wards that made up the LGs. These LGs include Ikeja, Makurdi, and Apapa. The older parts of urban areas were better served by health and education facilities - an indication that LGs in the peri-urban areas may be disadvantaged in the provision of these facilities. The older LGs have demonstrated more maturity in the equitable provision of urban basic facilities, including education and health facilities, to ensure that each Ward had their own facilities, as demonstrated by Apapa, Makurdi, AMAC, and Lagos Mainland.

2.7 EXISTENCE OF CITIZENS' CHARTER:

2.7.1 Adoption of Citizens' Charter and Public Awareness

The response rate showed that none of the LGs has adopted a Citizen's Charter. Most LGs, probably, have not adopted any Charter, but they are bound by some other Charters, such as: the National Constitution; those declared by the Ethnic Militia Groups, including Arewa, Odua, Egbesu, Ndigbo; etc. The Niger Delta people have adopted the Kaima Declaration, under which they are mounting pressure on the Federal Government for more control in the distribution of the revenues accruing from the huge oil deposits in the Niger Delta.

2.8 PROVISIONS FOR INFORMAL BUSINESS:

2.8.1 Incentives for Informal Business

Thirteen out of 18 LGs (72%) indicated that they provide support for informal businesses. Many LGs provide support to informal business through providing loans, charging reasonable fees, providing markets, and charging reasonable taxes for trading spaces as well as tolerating on-street-trading, among others.

2.8.2 Regulatory Control on Informal Businesses

Three out of four LGs studied (76%) were involved in regulating the activities of the informal sector. Most LGs which are currently not involved with land use planning and enforcement of land use development control standards are likely not to see their role in this realm. Since planning is done by State Agencies, it is these agencies that can lay claim to perform this role. The demolitions of illegal structures in most cities have been undertaken by the States and not LGs.

2.8.3 Restrictions of Street Trading

Fifteen out of 18 LGs (83%) prohibit street-trading. Again, the enforcement of street-trading is likely to be imposed by State Governments, as opposed to LGs. However, Ikeja LG responded that street trading is not permitted in the LG area, and there was no indication that the LG provides special support to informal businesses.

2.8.4 Confrontations between Traders and Authorities over Restrictions

Only 5 LGs, out of the 18 LGs (28%) said they have experienced cases of confrontations, e.g. the protest by the Computer Sellers Association in Ikeja; protest against collection of taxes in the market on public holidays in Makurdi; and, protests against forceful demolitions and evictions of residents of the Waterside areas of Port Harcourt.

2.9 GENDER EQUALITY:

2.9.1 Adoption of Affirmative Action and Women Participation in Governance

There is, at present, no adoption of Affirmative Action by the Federal Government, even though the country is a signatory to several international conventions and resolutions on the issue. Therefore, no LG in the country has adopted the affirmative action. However, the data collected showed that several LGs have attained and even surpassed the minimum of 35% representation of women in appointed positions that is being peddled as the standard for affirmative action. The standard attained varies from 8% in Kaduna North to as high as 81% for Onitsha North.

2.9.2 Proportion of Women Elected Councilors

The responses show little or no participation of women in contesting elections. At most, some LGs can boast of one elected women councilors, e.g. AMAC, Bwari, Lagos Mainland, Onitsha and Port Harcourt.

2.9.3 Women who Voted in the Last Election

The analysis shows that data on this variable were not made available at the Local and State Government levels. This may not be unconnected with the very vexed and corrupt elections conducted which might have prevented the release of data so as to prevent the use of such data in Election Tribunals. Data availability or no availability, there was a general feeling that women are marginalized in the electoral process.

2.10 ACCESS TO EDUCATION:

2.10.1 Primary School Enrolment, Completion Rates & Measures

The provisions for primary schools are the responsibilities of LGs. The MDG is hinged on universal access to primary education. The results showed that Port-Harcourt has the highest primary school enrolment followed by AMAC, Onitsha, and Bwari. The combined figures for the six LGs in the Lagos Mega-city tend to show that Primary school enrolment would be higher than that of the other cities. Data showed no great gender disparity in enrolment

between boys and girls in primary school within the sampled LGs except for Gombe with State female level enrolment of 31.1%. Analysis of the data collected showed that the different measures adopted by LGs to promote enrolment include; public enrolment campaign, provision of books, construction of classrooms, providing speed boats for access and introduction of school bus in physically-challenging topography. The activities of LGs are regulated by the State Primary Education Board.

2.11 RESPECT OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RULE OF LAW:

2.11.1 Harmful Traditional Practices

Very few LGs affirm the existence of harmful traditional practices in their areas, for example, AMAC. However, the baseline survey revealed the existence of harmful cultural practices, attracting zero percentage for most LGs and peaking at 15.5% for Kaduna South. There are, however, higher figures recorded for the perception of illegal trials than for harmful traditional practices. The perception of illegal trials varies from zero perception recorded for AMAC, Surulere, and Mushin, to as high as 64% recorded for Port-Harcourt.

2.11.2 Illegal Trials of Offenders

The baseline survey shed some light on whether crimes committed in the LGs were tried illegally. For example, those who said that they knew about such trials amounted to 26.6%, while 50% of the respondents said 'no', and those who 'did not know' amounted to 19.3%.

2.12 PARTICIPATION:

Participation, as an element of good governance, entails the involvement of all and sundry in the local decision-making process. Effective participation is based on the freedom of speech and association and requires developing the capacity to constructively engage political office holders and institutions on issues relating to the welfare of citizens.

2.13 CIVIC ENGAGEMENT/CONSENSUS-BUILDING:

Civic engagement and consensus building is a measure of the involvement of different actors in urban governance with a view to accommodating different interests and opinions on what is in the best interest of the whole community and how this can be achieved.

2.13.1 Role accorded Non-indigenes in Governance

From the data collected, most LGs accorded recognition to non-indigenes in the governance of their areas, since non-indigenes are also beneficiaries of good governance in the communities. However, data showed that there are no non-indigenes holding elective posts in Gombe, Kaduna South, and Lagos Island. Nevertheless, these LGs went further to comment that non-indigenes could be given appointment in the employment of the LGs but are not allowed to stand election. However, non-indigenes who are recruited from the LG, are often allowed to contest elective positions as reported for Akure North LG.

2.14 CONDUCT OF REFERENDUM AND METHODS OF CIVIC ENGAGEMENT:

2.14.1 Conduct of Referendum

Of the various methods of civic engagement investigated, the conduct of referendum in the LGs had received very low response. Most LGs said they had never conducted a referendum. However, Lagos State has a history of conducting a referendum, as one was conducted by the State Government before the creation of the additional 37 local governments (i.e. Local Council Development Areas) in Lagos State.

2.14.2 The Use of Other Methods of Engagement

The use of other methods of engagement, such as the involvement of women, children, collaboration with NGOs, faith-based organisations (FBOs), and traditional rulers, in the practice of participatory budgeting, varies with LGs. The data showed that LGs from Gombe, Makurdi, Lagos,

Rivers, and Anambra, States used a combination of all these methods of engagement, but with the exception of referendum.

2.15 WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN GOVERNANCE:

As useful as this indicator is, there was a recurrence of lack of data by the field researchers, including from the State Independent Electoral Commission offices. The explanation for this appears to be political and it is perhaps due to the much disputed election results in the country and the unwillingness of INEC to make such data available. However, the impression was given that women turned out *en masse* to vote in some local governments, such as Ikeja LG. Nevertheless, the assessment team was unable to aggregate information on the percentage of actual voters in the last election compared to those registered. The lack of data is a definite hindrance to planning for effective participation of women in elections and governance.

2.16 PARTNERSHIP-BUILDING:

This indicator provided information on the provision of social services through the adoption of public private partnership (PPP) policies by the LGs in the past three years.

2.16.1 Adoption of Policy on PPP and Sectoral Application

Although the majority of the LGs studied were yet to adopt a PPP policy, all of them have been implementing some shades or variants of PPP, except for the six LGs selected from the Lagos Mega-city, which emphatically mentioned that they are bound by the Lagos State Policy on PPP. Under the adopted policy, the LGs in the Mega-city had responded that they forge partnerships with the organised private sector (OPS), NGOs, and CBOs, in the implementation of certain programmes - with health and education sectors constituting the more common areas of PPP application, rather than security and school-feeding programmes.

2.17 PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING:

The Lagos Mainland LG responded that it practices some form of participatory budgeting, by involving elected representatives who hold meetings with the citizens at Ward and CDA levels, to identify the needs of their communities prior to subsequent deliberations by the heads of departments in the LG and Councillors, upon which approval and budgeting would be based.

2.18 SECURITY:

Security, as an element of good governance, relates to the inalienable right of every citizen to life, liberty, and the security of their person (lives) and properties. It entails getting all stakeholders involved in crime and conflict prevention, and disaster-preparedness, with a view to reducing or avoiding human conflicts and natural disasters.

2.19 EFFECTIVE POLICING:

2.19.1 Challenges to Effective Policing

Several security challenges confronting all the LGs include manpower shortage, inadequate infrastructure, limited financial resources and lack of control over the police at the state and local governments. In general, the greatest challenge is that the police force is controlled by the Federal Government, and not the State, or the Local Government. Thus, both agencies can absolve themselves of any security negligence on their part. However, the extent to which both the States and the LGs have been able to cooperate with police officers deployed to their areas is a sure test of success. Due to the lack of control, most States and LGs could only provide additional supports to effective policing provided at the State and Local governments (details of which are elaborated in the Study Report).

2.19.2 Existing Capacity for Effective Policing

Most LGs did not provide data on police personnel. The only exceptions were found in Gombe, Akure North, Onitsha North, Makurdi, and Ikeja. The

percentage of women employed in the police force varied from about 16% recorded for Onitsha to 21% recorded for Gombe. The number (ratio) of police to 1,000 people varies from less than 1 per thousand in Ikeja LG and Akure North, to 3.9 per thousand for Makurdi LG. The number of Vigilante Groups set up to back-up policing varies from 3 in Onitsha South to 9 in Onitsha North. These figures indicate the inadequacy of the police personnel and the increased concern of the communities to assist the police to maintain law and order in their areas.

2.19.3 Crime Rates

Majority of the LGs did not make data available on crimes. The data supplied by a few LGs were not generally comparable across LGs, as such data were often gathered, using different format.

2.19.4 Budgetary Allocation for Security

Data on expenditure on security were not made available. This might be connected with the implicit fact that security votes are never made public; and, this might pose problems as to getting the exact figures. Ikeja had made an attempt to report on a piece of LG budget for security purpose. However, the budget was far too low and grossly inadequate to ensure security. Many State governments often made reasonable budgets available for security management.

2.19.5 Establishment of Police Community Relations Committee (PCRC) and the Gender Desk

Almost all the LGs have established a PCRC. The Committee provides logistics support to the police, especially the ones that cannot be provided by the Government. Sometimes, the PCRC engages in renovation of police stations and provision of chairs, toilets, and other essential facilities. The PCRC also provides security information to the police. The PCRCs have risen to the occasion to provide security information to the Police. Not all the LGs have successfully established a Gender Desk. The LGs that have done so include Ikeja and Lagos Island in Lagos State.

2.20 ENVIRONMENTAL SECURITY MEASURES:

Environmental security is related to other issues, such as: appropriate street naming; house numbering and existence of street maps; and standard of house-fencing adopted. The GUG assessment probed into the existence of measures, such as land use plans, building regulations, and design guides, for promoting environmental security in the LG.

2.20.1 Existence of Land-Use and Building Design Guidelines and Standards

There is a general lack of comprehensive land use planning and development plans for all the LGs, except LGs in Lagos, Rivers, Anambra, States and Abuja FCT. This is simply because these LGs are yet to exercise the power conferred on them to plan and manage their cities to achieve environmental safety and sustainability. Most LGs do not exercise any control on land and design of building guidelines/standards. Such mandate is exercised by the States' Ministries of Physical Planning and Urban Development.

2.20.2 Adoption of National Building Code

The National Building Code was passed in 2007 and meant to be adopted by the various States. While many state governments are still foot-dragging, the Lagos State Government has passed its legislation which reflected the provisions of the National Building Code. As most LGs do not exercise any control on land use planning and design of building, they may therefore have nothing to do with the enforcement of building code.

2.20.3 Incidences of Collapsed Building

Incidences of collapsed buildings, which are on the rise in some cities in Nigeria, represent a clear failure of the effective governance of the land use planning and building control system. For instance, in the Ikeja Local Government, there was no record of collapsed building, and no cases of forced eviction of slum dwellers/squatters in the last three years.

2.20.4 Pollution Control Measures

Control of pollution is a state function. Both the LG and the various State Environmental Protection Agencies have adopted joint control measures/standard for land, air, water and noise pollution. The practice varies according to State.

2.21 WASTE MANAGEMENT:

Although waste management is one of the constitutional roles of the LG, most LGs have not been effective in waste disposal. For reasons of neglect of this vital service due to capacity gaps, some States have taken over the role of waste management as shown in the chapter dealing with effectiveness in service delivery. Due to the huge cost involved in the purchase of equipment and high population, state governments are compelled to support the local governments by providing them with logistics for waste disposal. This is being done in collaboration with the private sector with support from donors like the World Bank.

2.22 EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS PLAN:

The simple but disturbing fact is that most LGs do not have emergency preparedness plans. This role is likely to be undertaken by State and National Governments. The National Emergency Management Authority (NEMA), set-up at Federal level, is responsible for coordinating emergency preparedness in the country. The NEMA works through the State Government. There are indications that some States, such as Lagos, are involving LGs in emergency preparedness.

2.23 CONFLICT RESOLUTION MEASURES:

The GUG framework sought to assess the use of alternative dispute resolution methods for promoting a speedy dispensation of justice.

2.23.1 Use of Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)

All the LGs use Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR). ADR is handled by traditional/community leaders, spiritual leaders (pastors, imams) and

through community/police referral system. Examples of dispute cases handled through ADR methods include issues involving husband and wife, siblings, tenants and landlords, and fights involving market women.

2.24 TENURE SECURITY:

Going by the provisions of the Land Use Act, all the LGs studied were urban LGs, and therefore do not have responsibility for land administration, unlike their rural counterparts. As LGs are not involved in land administration it has serious implication for their ability to adopt any policy on social housing scheme. It was however interesting that AMAC has been able to develop housing estate based on sites and services.

2.24.1 Cases of Forced Evictions

Most LGs studied said there had not been any case of forced eviction of slum dwellers/squatters in the last three years in most LGs. But in administering development control in many cities, cases of demolitions of illegal structures and proscription of street trading are common phenomena. In many instances these actions are often carried out without going through the due process of law. The cases of demolitions and evictions carried out in most cities have been by State agencies and not LGs.

2.25 SOCIAL HOUSING:

All the LGs studied do not have any policy on the promotion of social housing scheme because of limited land availability. The exception as pointed out earlier is the AMAC which has been able to develop a housing estate by adopting the sites and services principle. Again, this is tied to the fact that AMAC and Bwari have been given planning role, unlike their other counterparts in this study.

2.26 ACCOUNTABILITY:

Accountability improves a government's legitimacy and is linked with the issue of transparency, which implies availability and clarity of information

provided to the general public about government activities. It requires that government go beyond provision of information to access to information for all citizens in order to ensure their participation in governance.

2.27 TRANSPARENCY AND FREE FLOW OF INFORMATION:

2.27.1 Practice of Free Flow of Information

All the LGs studied, except Kaduna South and Kaduna North, claimed that they imbibed the principle of transparency and accountability by promoting free flow of information, using a variety of methods which included publication and dissemination of annual reports, organizing town hall/CDA meetings and use of mass media (radio, TV and print). Many of the LGs used the conventional method for disseminating information, as only a few of them have functional websites. However, there were also FGDs conducted where participants contradicted the existence of free flow of information by the LGs.

2.28 MECHANISM FOR PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT:

2.28.1 Use of Yearly Performance Appraisal and Sanctions

Analysis of the data collected had shown that four of the LGs, namely, Akure North, Akure South, AMAC, and Gombe, out of 21 LGs studied, did not adopt the use of annual appraisal for measuring performance. However, only three LGs indicated that they ever sanctioned staff for not meeting the set performance targets.

2.29 ELIMINATION OF CORRUPTION:

2.29.1 Adoption of Due Process for the Contract Award and the Use of Independent Audit

All the LGs indicated that they use due process in the award of contracts and the conduct of independent audits, as two measures for checking corruption. Many of the LGs said they used the tender board for contract awards.

2.29.2 Circulating the Annual Audit Reports

There is a laid down process to be employed by LGs for disseminating the findings of audited report (This is elaborated in the GUG Study Report). On the issue of Press releases, the responses were not encouraging, as Press releases were not made.

2.29.3 Implementation of the Recommendations of the Auditors Report

The recommendations made by the Auditor-General for Local Governments are acted upon by the Local governments, State House of Assembly, and the Ministry of Local Government. After considerations of the recommendations by the Auditor-General for Local Governments, the State House of Assembly makes its own recommendations to the Ministry of Local Government, while the latter makes recommendations to the local governments for compliance.

2.30 CODE OF CONDUCT:

There is a national Code of Conduct binding on all civil servants. In compliance with the avowed National policy, an LG needs to adopt a Code of Conduct for its staff.

2.30.1 Adoption of Code of Conduct

The data collected showed that most LGs are yet to adopt the national Code of Conduct, but still relied on the public service set rules and regulations, such as the Civil Service Handbook, Establishment Circular, Financial Memoranda, Financial Regulation, and LG Scheme of Service, to guide the conduct of its staff. Furthermore, the data revealed that it is the responsibility of the Code of Conduct Bureau (CCB) to distribute forms for declaration of asset to every member of staff of the LG, which should be completed and returned to the Bureau. Most LGs' management believes that compliance with the requirements of the Code of Conduct is not strictly enforced by LGs.

2.30.2 Publication and Awareness of Code of Conduct

The assessment shows that the code has been well-publicized by the respective authority. The responsibility for administering the Code rests not with the LG but the National Code of Conduct Bureau.

2.30.3 Cases of Indictment of LG Officials for Providing False Information about Asset-Declaration

This indicator probed into cases of indictment of officials for providing false information in asset declaration. Many LGs, except Akure North, had declared that there had not been any reported case(s) of corruption charges leveled against government officials by the LG Staff. The Baseline Survey results showed that trials of offenders were not taken seriously.

2.31 CITIZENS' DEMAND FOR ACCOUNTABILITY:

The GUG assessment probed into cases of grievances expressed, either by the general public, NGOs, CBOs, FBOs, and PSOs, about bad governance in the LG, or the State, bordering on LGs in the past three years with examples.

2.31.1 Cases of Grievances against Bad Governance in LGs

Nearly all the LGs reported that they had not received any protests but, perhaps, an indication that the LGs' management may not wish to admit that their LGs have experienced public protests for bad governance. However, the Lagos Mainland LG had indicated that they use complaints to elected representatives as a method of receiving grievances (as further documented in the Study Report). Only 20% of the sampled population was willing to engage their LGs on governance issues, was very low. The figures for those willing to engage their LGs varied from 2% recorded in the Owerri Municipal LG, to 58% for the Owerri North LG. However, during the FGDs conducted with some stakeholders, there were claims that people are reluctant to demand for accountability because Local Government officials find it offensive.

2.32 EXHIBITED CHALLENGES:

The various analyses carried out in the previous chapters have manifested several challenges in the five elements of governance investigated, which are outlined below:

2.32.1 Effectiveness

The practice of adopting vision/missions, land use plans for poverty reduction and promoting other developmental initiatives needs to be sustained to combat the apathy exemplified by some LGs. LG's recognition of its statutory roles is another good point that needs to be complimented with efficiency in service delivery. The following challenges need to be addressed:

- i) Poor importance accorded to visioning strategic development through planning and implementation of plans.
- ii) Poorly publicized and non participatory LG vision and mission.
- iii) Encroachment on the Constitutional Roles of LGs, especially in the areas of revenue collection.
- iv) Low capacity for resource mobilization through IGR
- v) Unavailability of clear and published procedures for accessing the services of the LG.
- vi) Unduly long time for LG to react to public complaints
- vii) Limited autonomy due to FCDA control of the LG on land matters and senior staff recruitment.
- viii) Serious capacity gaps in the delivery of services due to inadequate organizational structure, staffing resources, management, inadequate logistical supports, and poor funding.
- ix) *The capacity gaps in service delivery , often translating to lack of essential urban infrastructures.*
- x) Limited decentralization of LG power to lower units, as the lower tier does not exercise power in the provision and maintenance of public services.
- xi) Non-recognition of urban centers as corporate entity and

- administrative unit for promoting urban governance.
- xii) Low capacity to mobilize and manage resources, as most LGs have not operated beyond two sources of funding, namely: Statutory transfers from Federation account and State Governments; and the IGR. Of the two more popular sources, there is over dependency on statutory transfers.

2.32.2 Equity

The concern for poverty reduction must be actively translated into policy and legislations for sustainability. Some existing challenges continue to undermine whatever strides of achievement could have been made in this enterprise, including:

- i) Non-adoption of policies and legislations to back-up various pro-poor initiatives being implemented by LGs in education. Current interventions have been through ad-hoc projects.
- ii) Unavailability of citizen charter to define the right and privileges of the people.
- iii) Poor incentives for the informal business sector and nonprovision of alternatives for displaced informal business operators.
- iv) Low female participation in governance.
- v) Gender inequality and existence of traditional practices that discriminate against women.
- vi) Lack of support for the informal sector.

2.32.3 Participation

The shades of participatory approaches being implemented by LGs should be matched by strengthened capacity to achieve the full goal of truly inclusive approaches, and amelioration of existing gaps of the following nature:

- i) Inability of LGs to meaningfully engage the citizen in participatory budgeting and preparation of vision/mission statements;
- ii) Low participation of the traditional rulers, women and youth in decision making;
- iii) Limited partnership building in the LGA, to the exclusion of the

NGOs and CBOs.

2.32.4 Security

The various issues under security include the following:

- i) Low capacity for effective policing, most especially in the rural areas due to inadequate police personnel and equipment.
- ii) Lack of control of state and LGs over security issues affecting their areas.
- iii) Lack of effective means of capturing data on crime for planning, programme design, monitoring and evaluation.
- iv) Low access to land by the vulnerable group and tenure insecurity.
- v) There is the need to intensify efforts to eradicate perceived harmful traditional practices.
- vi) Forceful eviction without adequate resettlement programmes.
- vii) Non-adoption of environmental preparedness plans etc.

2.32.5 Accountability

The following change interventions, plus attention to the demands strategic institution-building for organizational development for GUG, are required:

- i) Methods of promoting free flow of information for promoting accountability need to be strengthened.
- ii) Inability to establish and document specific standards for performance assessment.
- iii) There is need to step-up action to ensure that offenders are prosecuted.
- iv) Poor dissemination of audit report to the public for the purpose of openness and transparency.
- v) Low level of citizen demand for accountability.

2.33 STRUCTURAL/ORGANIZATIONAL PROBLEMS:

Many studies, including the GUG Study, have shown the inadequacy of the existing structure for the performance of LGs in general and, especially, those in the urban areas. Some of the extant structural problems include the

following:

2.33.1 Creating LGs without City-wide Organizational Structure

Reforming urban areas into several LGs, without corresponding provision of a solid organizational apparatus for city-wide governance, is one of the structural problems facing many urban LGs in the country. The splitting of urban areas into multiple LGs and the absence of city-wide administrative structure for urban governance is one of the critical problems facing urban local governments. For instance, it is difficult to know who is in charge of the City, whereas we may have several LG Chairmen or Chairpersons in charge of the Divisions of Cities.

The way forward is to create a city-wide organization structure, by creating a Local Metropolitan Government Council for a Metropolitan area, and by retaining the existing urban LGs as District LGs. The need for creating such a body has been confirmed by the recent creation of the Port-Harcourt Authority, which will oversee the governance of the city. These new agencies will have to perform metropolitan-wide functions, such as transportation, water supply, planning, and those functions usurped by States from the Local Governments.

2.33.2 Inadequate Internal Organization Structure of LGs for Effective Service Delivery

The absence of essential departments for the effective functioning of LGs is another structural problem that needs to be addressed. The study showed lack of the necessary linking (or connectivity) of services delivered by LGs to budgeting. With regard to the performance of constitutional roles, all LGs in the country are not properly structured, or even basically properly staffed to effectively perform their roles. In addition, data and information planning as well as project design at the LG level are virtually non-existent.

Consequently, there is a need to review the existing structure and staffing of LGs, or the baseline strategic human resource management (HRM)

requirements, in order to fundamentally establish (i.e. build or create) the required departments for the LGs to be able to perform their roles effectively. There is need for LGs to set up all the essential departments, such as parks and gardens, local planning authority, database or statistics, etc, to enable them effectively perform their roles. There is the need to create a data production Unit or Section that is attached to the Economic Planning Department/Authority essentially charged with continuous empirical (credible) data-generation and management, for purposes of necessary statistical decision-making, longitudinal development planning, and solid organizational development (OD) - in the tradition of international best practices of good urban governance (GUG).

2.33.3 Autonomy of LGs and Clear Role Definition

The analysis in connection with the variable of 'subsidiarity' had shown that most LGs either enjoy partial, or no, autonomy, at all. In reality, the LGs exist as mere puppets of State governments. The denial of full autonomy is unconstitutional. Absence of election is a ploy by the State to weaken the executive power and functioning of LGs. For nearly eight years of democratic rule under some governance, many State Governments are yet to conduct elections into Local Governments.

More specifically, the following notes and suggestions are further made:

- The capacity of ALGON needs to be strengthened for advocacy on a number of governance issues at the local level.
- Constitutional provision on the tenure of LGs and elections into LGs needs to be implemented.
- All the functions of LGs, already usurped by States, should revert to the LGs; and especially those in urban areas, as some of these functions should be handled by the recommended agency.

2.33.4 Resource Mobilization

All LGs currently face the problem of under-funding. This problem is compounded by the usurpation of role of LGs by the State Government, including mobilizing funds through tenement rating. The present

arrangement does not allow LGs to borrow money to fund capital projects. The way forward includes the following:

- The formula for revenue allocation is positively skewed in favour of both the Federal and State Governments, to the detriment of LGs. There is need to review revenue-sharing formula to increase the share of LGs.
- There is need to strengthen the capacity of LGs to mobilize funds through IGR driving. In order to encourage LGs to mobilize funds through IGR is to tie a per cent of statutory allocation to amount of IGR mobilized.
- There is need to review the existing policy and practices which restrict LGs to obtain loans for capital projects. Credit-rating of LGs should be conducted to identify those that can be trusted to obtain and manage loans for project execution.

2.33.5 The Scourge of Social Corruption

In practical terms, one measure of the existence of the problem of corruption in governance, including LG system, is the extent or prevalence of such deviant behavior as the lack of transparency, probity and accountability in the driving and reckoning of governance processes as well as the tendency to replace organizational performance emphasis with sheer social patronage, within the context of the various tiers of government.

III. CONCLUSIONS ON THE GUG STUDY

3.0 CONCLUSIONS:

- Overall, it can be concluded that this Study has basically generated a country-led GUG framework, with an embedded innovative, participatory, approach to data-collection and project management.
- The GUG Study has contributed to the aggregation of rigorous baseline data that are usable in monitoring progress, or the lack of it. The results of this study exhibit the profile of local governance in Nigeria. They provide a veritable platform for upstream engagement and a useful starting-point for future programme design.
- Besides, the Study has essentially been instrumental in fulfilling the task of generating relevant data and information that can be used variously for the extant, or continuing, normative, and operational pursuits of the LGs:
- Through the participatory nature of the same Study process, its subjection to critical deliberation by stakeholders, and the various recommendations advanced (and which are situated in later segments of this chapter of the Study Report), the Report appears to have succeeded in establishing a consensus on the need to initiate governance reforms in several areas as detailed under recommendations for short-term, medium-term, and long-term interventions.
- From the volume of series of evidence aggregated by the GUG Study, it is apparent that operations and practices at the various tiers of government have depicted various development needs and gaps that obviously detract from the ideals of good urban governance.

- In more specific terms, the following particular mentions (out of various others) are further noteworthy:
- From visioning to missioning, and plan implementation (which are outcomes of strategic planning and management applications), field findings have confirmed a general lack of adoption of the participatory and inclusive approach;
 - On service delivery by the LGs (e.g. concerning tenement rating, solid waste management, street-naming, etc), the widespread pattern was one that portrayed a general practical usurpation of the constitutional functions of the LGs another deviation from international norms of GUG;
 - The perceptions of the civil populace about the effectiveness and efficiency of service delivery, by the LGs, also very much reflected the latter's political predicament and seeming dearth of operational capacity;
 - As important as budgeting is, even at the LG level (being an important managerial tool in urban governance), the fact that the generality of LGs was typically often strapped for money to finance capital projects had also depicted the serious financial handicap, or indisposition, of these LGs to meaningfully explore worthwhile capital development, and sustainable public project management;
 - Further still, and arising from the ideals of subsidiarity, the findings of the GUG Study had confirmed the fears that the attainment of the constitutional goal of relative autonomy by the LGs is far from reality in the Nigerian context;
 - On resource mobilization, the most obvious revenue platforms for the LGs are the statutory allocations by the Federal Government, often through the State apparatuses, as well as internally-generated revenues (IGR). But, unfortunately, the fact that most LGs continue to rest on their oars by being overly-reliant on the statutory grants, rather than creatively or innovatively harnessing

viable other platforms of robust revenue generation, is a developmental non-starter;

- It cannot be over-stated that strategic capacity building for the LG System, including strategic human resourcing and the continuous development of human capital, is a critical requirement for assuring greater development futures of the LGs, in order to possibly fully attain the ideals of GUG in Nigeria.
- In the final analysis, it is also necessary to conclude with some of the areas of reforms that are deserving of national interventions, such as:
- The need to review the extant Structure of LGs, their set-up, and develop functional institutional framework to promote city-wide governance;
 - The necessity to critically review the Constitutional roles of the three-tier government structure;
 - The urgency to promote and assure the autonomy of LGs;
 - The desirability to equitably review revenue allocation formula among the three-tier government;
 - The strategic utility of conducting a Referendum/Adopting the Citizens' Charter; and,
 - The standardization of periodic conduct of GUG assessment of Nigeria, to serve as the benchmark for evaluating the performance of all LGs in the country.
- In addition, and in connection with the variable of sustainability, stakeholders across the country appear to be agreed on the desirability and practicability of institutionalising the GUG Assessment Project. The National Bureau of Statistics (NBS), as the national agency for empirical data-generation and publishing in the country, is therefore urged to synchronize the conduct of GUG assessment with the regular national statistical programme.

- Further still, given the nature of the subject matter of good urban governance, the NBS would also, in particular, be required to work closely with the Federal Ministry of Lands, Housing and Urban Development in ensuring that future National GUG Reports are produced and published periodically.
- In addition, it is also very necessary to strengthen the capacities of some critical associated agencies, including national statistical offices, universities and research institutions as well as the monitoring, evaluation and policy Units within State administrations and/or Local Governments, for the purposes of institutionalising a country-led national system of the regular supply of governance data (indeed, highly reliable and valid official statistics and public records), recognizing the enormous necessity of objective data for strategic planning and decision-making in the arduous enterprise of social governance.
- Improved governance performance, as reflected in the successful usage of empirically-derived indices, may have enormous positive effects that are easily discernible at the macro-social level, such as in the attraction of robust foreign direct investment to further stimulate economic growth and balanced development as well as in the strengthening of social trust, itself, for the sustenance and longitudinal stability of the very governance systems.
- Moreover, the possibility of the foregoing may, in turn, also increase the incentives for strengthening the supply side of accountability and, thus, leading to a virtuous cycle.
- In addition, the country offices of the UN-HABITAT and UNDP are well placed to provide oversight technical and managerial functions, as stakeholders, in necessarily ensuring high quality of outputs comparable to that of the UNDP Human Development Report and the UN-HABITAT's State of Cities Report.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE GUG STUDY

4.0 RECOMMENDATIONS:

- The following recommendations are generally meant to feed policy, legislative and programmatic responses as well as assist in taking precautionary measures to enhance the performance of governance institutions and promote more effective, equitable, secure, participatory and accountable, processes/systems of governance.

4.1 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SHORT-TERM (OR IMMEDIATE) ACTIONS:

4.1.1 [On Effectiveness]

1. Promote advocacy and sensitize LGs, NGOs, and communities on participatory approaches to promoting development.
2. Replicate and complete the decentralization of the adoption of participatory PRSPs and Land use plans to all LGs in the country.
3. Build and strengthen the capacity of States and LGs in several areas for effectiveness in promoting participatory approaches to development, effective methods of information dissemination, mobilizing resources using IGR, efficient service delivery, and e-governance.
4. Review the budgeting system and develop a mechanism for relating it to service delivery.
5. Produce and publish guidelines for service delivery in all LGs.
6. Formalize some of the methods for grievance redressing mechanism such as conduct of town hall meetings, and use of suggestion boxes, the media, and ICT.
7. Promote awareness and strengthen the existing capacity of communities, NGOs, FBOs and CBOs to engage their LGs for effective governance in several areas, including improved service delivery and inclusive decision-making, transparency and accountability, etc.

8. Strengthen the capacity of ALGON to advocate on critical issues including LG autonomy, full decentralization of functions to LGs, timely conduct of LG elections etc towards promoting good governance.
9. Build the structure for tenement rating by promoting urban planning, street naming, property numbering and establishing geo-referenced data and build the capacity of LGs for resource mobilization.
10. Conduct a national capacity-building assessment of LGs, design and implement training modules for efficient service delivery.

4.1.2 [On Equity]

11. Produce and disseminate brochures and flyers on pro-poor projects by all LGs.
12. Produce Guidelines for equitable pro-poor intervention.
13. Promote pro-poor approach to land use planning, urban design and development control to accommodate the needs of the poor, women, informal and the medium and small scale entrepreneurs in LGs to achieve orderly development, rapid economic growth and sustainable livelihoods.
14. All tiers of government need to set the process in motion, in the immediate, for the adoption of citizen's charter and continuing through the intervening medium term to the long term.
15. Consolidate existing gains and formalize the adoption of affirmative action at LGs and ensure it covers appointment of women into senior management and elective positions and participation in other aspects of governance.
16. Strengthen capacity of NGOs/FBOs and Women Groups to advocate and sensitize on gender equality.
17. Advocate and sensitize all tiers of Government on the need to adopt of citizen's charter in the medium and long term in the country.

18. Consolidate existing gains and formalize the adoption of affirmative action at LGs and ensure it covers appointment of women into senior management and elective positions and participation in other aspects of governance
19. Strengthen the capacities of NGOs/FBOs and Women Group to advocate and sensitize on gender equality and other issues of governance at the grassroots level.
20. Strengthen the capacity of Departments of Education in all LGs to sustain the current drive towards achieving the MDG for universal access to primary education.
21. Produce and publish data on school enrolment in all LGs disaggregated by LG and sex.
22. Conduct a detailed study of harmful traditional practices in all LGs to design a programme for their eradication.
23. Promote continuous sensitization and awareness programme on traditional practices that are harmful and other sharp practices by police and government official and law enforcement agencies that amount to abuse of human rights.

4.1.3 [On Participation]

24. Build the capacity of LGs for participatory approaches to promoting development and decision-making at the local level.
25. Upscale and formalize the present consultative budgeting system to full-scale participatory budgeting for all Lgs.
26. Provide support to NGOs to build the capacity of LGs and communities for participatory budgeting.
27. Conduct stakeholders' survey and analysis in all LGs and update data annually from which credible and representative participants can be chosen from to participate in the decision making process regarding development initiatives.

28. Sensitize Federal, States, LGs and general public and build their capacities to employ referendum in deciding critical and contentious national issues of development.
29. Strengthen the capacity of INEC at Federal and State levels to collect, store and publish data on all elections that are disaggregated by gender, sex, wards, towns and Lgs.
30. Promote programme on political empowerment of women.
31. Publish and disseminate Guidelines on PPP application by States and LGs working together on the subject matter.

4.1.4 [On Security]

32. Review the 1999 Constitution to address critical issues, including who controls the police at the State and LG levels, police staffing, infrastructure provision and finance towards achieving effective policing at all levels of government.
33. Empowering all Police Stations to set-up Gender Desks and strengthen existing PCRCs.
34. Produce a framework for cost-sharing of policing at State and Local Government levels.
35. Develop a database on security which will cover all the indicators investigated under security as well as other relevant ones.
36. Promote awareness and sensitization programmes in all LGs on the critical environmental security issues such as climate change and pollution using the mass media and workshops.
37. Review the Land Use Act 1978 to ensure that adequate compensation is paid for land compulsorily acquired, easy access

to land for the poor and women; and security of titles.

38. Promote an awareness programme on ADR and strengthen the roles of traditional rulers, FBOs/CBOs and Ombudsman, through capacity-building adopting a formal policy.

4.1.5 [On Accountability]

39. Develop and adopt a strategy and framework for promoting free flow of information and ensuring mainstreaming ICT into the system to be developed.
40. Build and strengthen the capacity of LGs senior management to adopt annual work planning and appraisal and result-based management approaches towards setting performance standards for efficiency and accountability.
41. Decentralize the administration to States and LGs the enforcement of national code of conduct and build their capacities for efficient enforcement.
42. Review existing legal provisions on 'Due process' to eliminate all the loopholes for perpetuating corruption and make it more transparent and accountable.
43. Strengthen the capacity of NGOs, CBOs and FBOs to act as pressure groups, promote awareness and mobilize citizens about their rights to engage LGs on governance issues.

4.2 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR MEDIUM-TERM ACTIONS:

4.2.1 [On Effectiveness]

1. Continuing step-up of the promotion of advocacy and sensitization of LGs, NGOs, and participatory approaches to promoting development.
2. Continuation of building and strengthening of the operating capacity at the States and LGs in several areas for greater effectiveness in promoting participatory approaches to development, effective methods of information dissemination, mobilizing resources using IGR, efficient service delivery and e-governance.
3. Continuing to formalize and strengthen some of the methods for grievance redressing mechanism, such as town hall meetings, use of suggestion boxes, and complaints desks.
4. Reinforcing the new gradually-emerging institutional structures for the promotion of awareness and strengthening of the growing capacity of communities, NGOs, FBOs and CBOs to better engage their LGs for more effective governance in several areas, including improved service delivery, inclusive decision-making, transparency and accountability, etc.
5. Continually strengthening the capacity of ALGON to advocate on critical issues, including LG autonomy, full decentralization of functions to LGs, timely and credible conduct of LG elections, etc, towards permanently acculturating tenets of good governance.
6. Produce blue print and guidelines on decentralization of roles to sub-national units.
7. Further developing and reinforcing the structure for tenement rating, by promoting urban planning, street naming, property-numbering and establishing geo-referenced data and continuing to build capacity for optimal resource mobilization.
8. Continue the work of strategic capacity-building, through deeper investments in computerization of financial systems in LGs, and further development of geo-referenced databases for property identification, numbering and tenement rating, a more strategic

budgeting system that prioritizes service delivery at the LGs, etc.

9. Continuous investment in human capital development, and organizational development, to necessarily raise employee commitment levels and enhance the quality of working lives as well as brighten the climate of employment in the LG system.
10. Review and re-define the Constitutional roles of Federal, State and Local Government to eliminate problems of encroachment and duplication of roles.
11. Review and evaluate existing organizational structure of LGs and formalize the adoption of either the creation of Parastatals, or the Metropolitan Board, for improved management of service delivery in LGs

4.2.2 [On Equity]

12. Adopt participatory and well-publicized strategy and guidelines for promoting pro-poor project intervention to ensure equity.
13. Advocate and promote sensitization programme for legislators at Federal and State levels, and the general public, on the need to adopt Citizen's charter and promote good governance.
14. Continue to support programmes and policies in favour of affirmative action also at the LGs, and particularly further ensuring that the appropriate appointment of women into senior management and elective position as well as participation in other aspects of governance are adequately and fundamentally protected by these social policies.
15. Conducting gender auditing of existing policies and programmes so as to design and implement an awareness programme on gender equality, through the mass media and sensitization workshops.
16. Adopt relevant policies/legislation that guarantees the right of non-

indigenes residing in an area, who are Nigerians, to contest elections at all levels of governance.

17. Further upscale and formalize the present consultative budgeting system to full-scale participatory budgeting for all Lgs.
18. Carry out surveys on critically contentious issues of governance in the country that might require the conduct of referendum to resolve these issues.
19. Build the capacities of States and LGs to create an enabling environment for full and smooth operation of PPP through formulation and adoption of necessary policies, the taking of regulatory measures at States and LG levels, and training of personnel.

4.2.3 [On Security]

20. Strengthen the capacities of all LGs to more effectively provide security at the Ward and City levels, to collect, analyze, store and publish data on crimes, in order to enhance planning, programming, monitoring and evaluation.
21. Produce a framework for cost-sharing of policing at State and LG levels.
22. Build the capacity of all State Governments to adopt their own Building Codes, Planning legislations and emergency preparedness policies and decentralize this to LGs level.
23. Promote full decentralization of the enforcement of building codes, land use planning and development control, and emergency preparedness to LGs towards promoting environmental security.
24. Continuing to promote awareness and sensitization programmes

in all LGs on the critical environmental security issues, such as climate change, pollution, etc, using mass media and capacity building workshops.

4.2.4 [On Accountability]

25. Further strengthening the capacity of NGOs, CBOs, and FBOs to act as pressure groups and watch dogs to promote consciousness on, and sensitivity to, governance issues of ethics and public accountability.
26. Leveraging on existing legal provisions on independent Audit to eliminate institutional gaps that may encourage social corruption, to constantly promote values of transparency and accountability.
27. Revisit such other policies, legislations, manners of extant organizational behaviour at the government level (States and LGs) which will continue to require legal reviews, better enforcement of normative behaviour, policy re-alignments, etc, in the direction of positive organizational development for good governance and promotion of increasingly acceptable governance behaviour.

4.3 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LONG-TERM ACTIONS:

4.3.1 [On Effectiveness]

1. Review and re-define Constitutional roles of Federal, State and Local Government to eliminate problems of encroachment and duplication of roles and putting in place institutional framework, procedures and mechanisms for ensuring effective governance of service delivery at urban and LG levels.
2. Permanently standardize or formalize the approaches of grievance handling and conflict resolution, to enhance social or public trust as well as promote an enduring culture of normative organizational behavior at the various levels of governance.
3. Institutionalize longitudinal process of continuous capacity building for awareness-promotion and the strengthening of operating

capacities at the States and LGs, including governance apparatuses of the communities and various civil society organizations (NGOs, CBOs, FBOs, etc), for the sake of generally effective governance, or the more specific needs of improved service delivery, inclusive decision-making, transparency and accountability.

4.3.2 [On Equity]

4. To continue to emphasize and adopt participatory as well as well-publicized strategies and guidelines which prioritize pro-poor project interventions, including in land-use planning, urban design and development control, etc, in the interest of equity and driving of creativity, entrepreneurship development, innovation and change, among other social outcomes of responsive governance.
5. Explore, in the long term, such multilateral actions that could catalyze support for and result in the embrace, adoption of the citizen's charter and its effective back-up with appropriate policies and legislation in promoting good governance.
6. Long term action is also required in the promotion and protection of sacrosanct human rights, through continuous sensitization, awareness programming, and the sanctioning of the otherwise harmful traditional practices that tend to constrain the protection of those rights.

4.3.3 [On Participation]

7. Public policies are needed that could also protect the political rights of indigenes who reside in locations other than their places of social origin to contest all levels of governance elections without prejudice, and with the back-up of enabling appropriate legislation.
8. Enthroned the practice of participatory or inclusive budgeting as a long-term best practice for proper development orientation.
9. Mechanisms of periodic process evaluation should be institutionalized for necessary assessment of governance practices and outcomes, in order to constantly align governance objectives with deed or the manifested outcomes, and as an index of good governance.

4.3.4 [On Security]

10. Provide social housing and promote slum upgrading in all LGs in order to improve social livelihoods in the existing slums.
11. Develop and operate a strategic database on security, which will reckon with all the indicators associated with security as well as relevant others.
12. Adopt and operate public policies that promote continuous expansion of capacity at all government levels, to enable provision of needed security at all these levels, the propagation of gender-friendly services, and realistic cost-sharing of policing between the States and LGs.

4.3.5 [On Accountability]

13. In the long term, the issue of accountability is also of essence; hence, the need to devise strategy and framework for promoting free flow of information and effective application of tools of modern information technology.
14. Necessity to leverage rational approaches of organization and management, through annual work planning, rigorous performance-based appraisals, the acculturation of tenets of probity, transparency and accountability, etc, cannot be overstated in the bid to progressively attain ideal levels of good governance.
15. Concerted multilateral action on the part of the multi-parties (i.e. the various tiers of government, ALGON, and donor agencies) will serve well the needs of enthroning ethical behavior and accountable, transparent, best practices in the tradition of good urban governance.

4.4 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FOLLOW-UP STUDIES:

- o The following recommendations are further made (as contained in the Study Report) towards improving the instrumentation, conduct, and effectiveness of future possible studies on the subject matter:
 - Desirability of conducting FGDs in a less mechanistic way (i.e. not primarily relying on structured questionnaires) but

rather leveraging on more flexible, open-ended platforms of social discourse that facilitate free, symbolic and spontaneous interaction on the theme of research. Such approach of fact-finding will enable a more in-depth investigation of the salient issues of research, and the possibility of richer discussion of measures to tackle such issues. Consideration should be given to holding FGDs after having done a preliminary analysis of the findings emerging from the Household Survey and from the administrative data collected. FGDs could be better designed to be more empirically probative as to deepen our understanding of key trends emerging from the application of the first two instruments.

Need to include some additional questions in the Household Survey battery and within the framework of the FGDs, as this will provide better setting for eliciting more robust answers. For instance, the question “How would you describe the process of access to land *by women and non-indigenes?*” may not necessarily be answered the same way by an indigene/male respondent (through the household survey) compared to a female/non-indigene respondent (in an FGD by women or an FGD by non-indigenes).

- A possible flexible usage of the questions in the household survey to complement (rather than repeat) those used in the collection of administrative data.
- The imperative of using questions that have relevance to better capture the governance aspects of service delivery, instead of measuring development outcomes for which data already exist, notably in MDG datasets (e.g. for the indicator, 'access to education', questions focus mainly on enrolment rates & completion rates; rather, they could have been better focused on affordability of education

(including informal payments), satisfaction with the quality of education provided, availability of sufficient supplies/teachers, etc).

- Additional need to consider new and relevant questions that could be added to the household survey instrument in order to ensure that, for each aspect that is measured, data are obtained from both the 'supply-side' (i.e. government institutions) and the 'demand-side' (i.e. citizens). For some principles (e.g. security), data are almost exclusively from administrative sources (e.g. policing capacity, etc), which risks depicting a one-sided picture (for instance, this does not say anything about people's sense of security, people's appreciation of the fairness of dispute-resolution mechanisms, etc).
- The methodological demand to review the GUG Index, in favour of adopting uniform and well-rationalized weightings to include all (composite) indicators possible, so as to eliminate or overly reduce the compounding effects of any implicit biases on the entire measurement process; including, e.g. necessarily assigning equal weighting to each element of governance, as incorporated, notwithstanding the total number of measurement indicators that are utilized overall.



